





Health Case for Basic Income

2020

Gary Bloch, Christine Bushey, Evelyn Forget, Arman Hamidian, Corey Neudorf, Amanda Pereira, Lisa Simon, Frank Welsh, and Adam Zvric



Health Case for Basic Income

PREPARED BY: Gary Bloch, Christine Bushey, Evelyn Forget, Arman Hamidian, Corey Neudorf, Amanda Pereira, Lisa Simon, Frank Welsh, and Adam Zvric

SUMMARY

People living with low income suffer from higher levels of chronic disease, infectious disease, poor mental health and substance use compared to those at higher income. They are also at risk of housing and food insecurity that exacerbates poor health outcomes. COVID-19 has magnified these inequities as the available data from Toronto and Montreal show that those of low socioeconomic status are more likely to become ill. These concerns have resulted in a renewed debate concerning a basic income program for Canada. The organizations listed in this brief call on the federal government to collaborate with the provinces, territories and Indigenous Peoples' governments to explore the development and implementation of a permanent basic income program.

ABOUT BASIC INCOME

Basic income means different things to different people. The Case for Basic Income series defines basic income as an incometested and targeted unconditional cash transfer from governments to individuals to enable everyone in Canada to meet their basic needs, participate in society, and live in dignity, regardless of work status.

Some Case project teams make more detailed recommendations about the principles to guide the design of a basic income program in Canada.

ABOUT THE CASE FOR BI SERIES

The Case for Basic Income series explores the impacts of a basic income program for various communities and policy areas across Canada. Each Case has been developed collaboratively by subject matter experts and basic income advocates to consider the distinct issues and concerns between the Case topic and income insecurity - and the difference that basic income might make.

Every Case is unique in both function and form and is guided by its authors and contributors.

Health Case for Basic Income

Income as a Social Determinant of Health

Living in poverty and with income insecurity affects a person's physical health, mental health and social wellbeing. Compared to higher income individuals, Canadians living in poverty experience (Public Health Agency of Canada [PHAC] & Pan-Canadian Public Health Network [PCPHN], 2018):

- 11.3 fewer healthy years;
- 1.5X the rate of infant mortality;
- 1.6X the rate of unintentional injury mortality;
- 2.7X the rate of suicide;
- 4.1X the rate of self-reported poor mental health;
- 1.4X the rate of asthma;
- 2x the rate of diabetes;
- 1.9X the rate of disability; and
- 1.9X the rate of smoking and 1.7X the rate of lung cancer.

In addition, children living in low-income households are at increased risk of poor functional and mental health, obesity, injury, and children are less prepared to perform well at school (Gupta et al., 2007; PHAC & PCPHN, 2018). Poverty, income insecurity, and poor health reinforce each other, making it harder for those living with low income to escape it. High rates of poverty and income inequality result in disproportionately higher use of health care resources (Rosella et al., 2014).

Poverty in Canada

One in seven Canadians (4.9 million) currently live in poverty (Statistics Canada, 2018). This situation is exacerbated by those living with employment precarity (i.e., working in positions that have some combination of limited opportunity, insecurity, and/or low or insecure income; Library of Parliament, 2020). In 2018, 25% of workers were precariously employed (Library of Parliament, 2018). Youth, women, immigrants, Indigenous persons, persons with disabilities and older adults are overrepresented among these workers which is noted in a recent Parliamentary report discussing these concerns (The Standing Committee On Human Resources, Skills And Social Development And The Status Of Persons With Disabilities [HUMA], 2019).

Income supports provided by provinces, territories and municipalities provide a level of support to those of low income but often require that individuals deplete existing assets and savings to even become eligible for benefits. Consequently, these individuals are unable to build on efforts and gains from previous income. This requirement traps recipients in low-income, further exposing them to increased health risks.

Basic Income and Health

Basic income presents an alternative to the current forms of social assistance. It is an

unconditional cash transfer from the government to individuals, regardless of their work status and commonly exist under one of two models: a universal demogrant model (where each person, regardless of income, receives a basic income) and a negative income tax model (NIT) (where access to and the amount of income support is based on need). The NIT model is often favoured as it targets those with the greatest need (Canadian Coalition for Public Health in the 21st Century, 2017).

Certain federal social assistance programs act as a form of basic income by providing financial supports to populations that fall below certain income levels. These include:

- Old Age Security (OAS) that provides all people over the age of 65 with a regular income and is based on a NIT model (the payment is provided to all but is reduced as income increases).
- Guaranteed Income Supplement (GIS) is an income supplement provided to seniors with incomes below a specific amount.
- The Canada Child Benefit (CCB) provides an income-tested support to families with children.

The OAS and GIS programs have moved Canada from having one of the highest levels of poverty for older adults among OECD countries to one of the lowest (HUMA, 2010), while the rate of food insecurity among this age group has dropped 50%. Similarly, the CCB has raised over 334,000 Canadian children above the poverty line. UNICEF views it as a model of an effective basic income program.

Previous Canadian Experiments

Two provinces have conducted basic income pilot projects using the NIT model.

- Manitoba Basic Annual Income Experiment (1975 – 1978): Research found an 8.5% reduction in hospitalizations and significant reductions in doctors' visits among residents of the locations that offered a basic income (Forget, 2011).
- Ontario Basic Income Pilot project (2017):
 This pilot project was cancelled after one year, but initial research (Ferdosi et al., 2020) showed positive health effects among participants, including:
 - Over 79% reported improvement in overall health;
 - 82% saw improvements in mental health, including less incidents of anxiety and depression;
 - Over one-third of participants with children noticed improvement in their child's health;
 - Recipients were better able to access necessary medication (82.7%), dental care (74.1%) and psychotherapy (50.4%), and
 - Individuals noted that they utilized health services less.

Cost of Basic Income

The Parliamentary Budget Office (PBO) has estimated the net-cost of providing a basic income for Canadians between the ages of 18 and 64 years at the levels of the Ontario experiment during a non-pandemic year as approximately \$44 billion annually for the Federal Government (PBO, 2018). These

calculations did not include potential downstream savings in healthcare costs, costs associated with the physical health risks of being low income, or other social programs. They also did not take into account consequent reductions in provincial spending on income assistance. A similar analysis for the implementation of a BI program during the pandemic showed significantly higher costs (PBO, 2021).

An inclusion of downstream health care savings into the analysis is important, as it shows that links exists between poverty and healthcare: the poorest neighbourhoods have significantly higher healthcare costs compared to wealthier counterparts (Glazier et al., 2000; National Collaborating Centre for Determinants of Health, 2016). In Ontario alone, estimates show that increasing the incomes of the poorest individuals could result in savings up to \$3.9 billion annually (Laurie, 2008).

Similarly, in 2008, it was estimated that \$1 invested in the early years of a child's life can save up to \$9 in future spending in the healthcare system (PHAC, 2008). While these savings could result from the CCB or the recent commitment to develop an early childhood education and care program, a basic income program could further alleviate this concern.

COVID-19 and Basic Income

COVID-19 presents an immediate health threat to those contracting the disease, as well as increased levels of unemployment, and income precarity with their associated potential long-term health implications. The establishment of

income relief and employment support programs (i.e., Canadian Emergency Relief Benefit (CERB), small business supports, etc.) have limited this threat by providing upwards of 8 million people the ability to meet their basic needs, including proper nourishment and access to necessary medication. These programs can be considered a form of temporary basic income.

Summary

Basic income has the potential to enable all Canadians to live healthier lives by reducing the compounding negative health effects associated with living in poverty. It is for this reason that the organizations noted below endorse developing a basic income for Canadians.

SEE ALSO

- <u>BICYN's</u> social media graphics about this Case report at <u>this link</u>.
- You can show your support for the Health Case for BI by endorsing this report as an individual or organization at this link.

References

Canadian Coalition for Public Health in the 21st Century. (2017). <u>Basic income position statement</u>.

Ferdosi, M., McDowell, T., Lewchuk, W., & Ross, S. (2020). Southern Ontario's basic income experiment.

Forget, E. (2011). The town with no poverty: The health effects of a Canadian guaranteed annual income field experiment. Canadian Public Policy, 37(3), 283–305.

Glazier, R. H., Badley, E. M., Gilbert, J. E., & Rothman, L. (2000). The nature of increased hospital use in poor neighbourhoods: Findings from a Canadian inner city. Canadian Journal of Public Health, 91(4), 268–273.

Gupta, R. P. S., de Wit, M. L., & McKeown, D. (2007). The impact of poverty on the current and future health status of children. *Paediatrics & Child Health*, 12(8), 667-672.

Laurie, N. (2008). <u>The cost of poverty: An analysis of</u> <u>the economic cost of poverty in Ontario</u>. Ontario Association of Food Banks.

Library of Parliament. (2018). <u>Precarious employment in Canada: An overview</u>.

Library of Parliament. (2020). <u>Understanding</u> <u>precarious work in Canada</u>.

National Collaborating Centre for Determinants of Health. (2016). <u>Discussion paper: Economic arguments for shifting health dollars upstream</u>.

Parliamentary Budget Officer. (2018). <u>Costing a national guaranteed basic income using the Ontario basic income model</u>.

Parliamentary Budget Officer. (2021). <u>Distributional</u> and <u>fiscal analysis of a national guaranteed basic</u> income.

Public Health Agency of Canada. (2008). <u>The Chief</u>
<u>Public Health Officer's report on the state of public</u>
health in Canada 2008 - Moving forward.

Public Health Agency of Canada, & Pan-Canadian Public Health Network. (2018). <u>Key health inequities in Canada: A national portrait.</u>

Rosella, L. C., Fitzpatrick, T., Wodchis, W. P., Calzavara, A., Manson, H., & Goel, V. (2014). <u>High-cost health care users in Ontario, Canada:</u>

<u>Demographic, socio-economic, and health status characteristics</u>. *BMC Health Services Research*, 14(1), 532.

Statistics Canada. (2018). <u>Table 11-10-0015-01:</u> <u>Before-tax and after-tax low income status (census family LIM) by family type and family composition.</u>

The Standing Committee On Human Resources, Skills And Social Development And The Status Of Persons With Disabilities. (2010). <u>Federal poverty reduction</u> <u>plan: Working in partnership towards reducing poverty in Canada</u>.

The Standing Committee On Human Resources, Skills And Social Development And The Status Of Persons With Disabilities. (2019). <u>Precarious work:</u> <u>Understanding the changing nature of work in Canada.</u>